

# Error estimation and adaptive mesh refinement for aerodynamic flows

Ralf Hartmann<sup>1</sup> and Paul Houston<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> *Institute of Aerodynamics and Flow Technology  
DLR (German Aerospace Center)*

*Lilienthalplatz 7, 38108 Braunschweig, Germany*

`Ralf.Hartmann@dlr.de`

<sup>2</sup> *School of Mathematical Sciences*

*University of Nottingham*

*University Park, Nottingham, NG7 2RD, UK*

`Paul.Houston@nottingham.ac.uk`

## Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>4</b>
1.1	Elements of function space theory . . . . .	6
1.1.1	Spaces of continuous functions . . . . .	6
1.1.2	Spaces of integrable functions . . . . .	7
1.1.3	Sobolev spaces . . . . .	7
<b>2</b>	<b>Motivation: Linear problems and adjoint equations</b>	<b>9</b>
2.1	Error estimation for linear problems . . . . .	9
2.2	Derivation of adjoint problems for linear primal problems . . . . .	11
2.3	The linear advection equation and adjoint problems . . . . .	11
2.4	Numerical example: Linear advection equation . . . . .	13
<b>3</b>	<b>Discontinuous Galerkin methods for compressible flows and their corresponding adjoint problems</b>	<b>15</b>
3.1	The compressible Euler equations . . . . .	15
3.2	Derivation of adjoint problems for nonlinear primal problems . . . . .	17
3.3	The adjoint equations to the compressible Euler equations . . . . .	17
3.4	DG discretization of the compressible Euler equations . . . . .	18
3.5	Consistency and adjoint consistency . . . . .	21
3.6	The compressible Navier-Stokes equations . . . . .	22
3.7	The adjoint equations to the compressible Navier-Stokes equations . . . . .	23
3.8	DG discretization of the compressible Navier-Stokes equations . . . . .	24
3.9	Consistency and adjoint consistency . . . . .	26

<b>4</b>	<b>Adjoint-based error estimation and adaptive mesh refinement</b>	<b>28</b>
4.1	Error estimation and mesh refinement for single target quantities . . . . .	28
4.2	Error estimation for multiple target quantities . . . . .	31
4.2.1	The standard approach . . . . .	31
4.2.2	A new approach . . . . .	32
4.3	Adaptive refinement for multiple target quantities . . . . .	33
4.4	Derivation of residual-based indicators . . . . .	35
4.5	Numerical examples . . . . .	36
4.5.1	Ringleb flow problem . . . . .	37
4.5.2	Supersonic flow past a wedge . . . . .	37
4.5.3	Supersonic flow past a BAC3-11 airfoil . . . . .	41
4.5.4	Supersonic viscous flow around the NACA0012 airfoil . . . . .	45
4.5.5	Comparison of the approximate error representation for viscous and inviscid flow. . . . .	49
4.5.6	Error estimation and adjoint-based refinement for multiple target quan- tities . . . . .	51
<b>5</b>	<b>Development of anisotropic mesh adaptation</b>	<b>63</b>
5.1	Model problem and discretization . . . . .	64
5.2	Meshes, finite element spaces and traces . . . . .	65
5.3	Interior penalty discontinuous Galerkin method . . . . .	66
5.4	Stability analysis . . . . .	68
5.5	Approximation results . . . . .	70
5.6	<i>A priori</i> error bounds . . . . .	77
5.7	<i>A posteriori</i> error estimation and adaptivity . . . . .	81
5.8	Numerical experiments . . . . .	83
5.8.1	Singularly perturbed advection-diffusion problem . . . . .	83
5.8.2	ADIGMA MTC3: Laminar flow around a NACA0012 airfoil . . . . .	87
5.8.3	ADIGMA BTC0: Laminar flow around streamlined body . . . . .	90
<b>6</b>	<b>High-order/<i>hp</i>-adaptive finite element methods for compressible flows</b>	<b>91</b>
6.1	Model problem and discretization . . . . .	93
6.1.1	Meshes and finite element spaces . . . . .	93
6.1.2	Stability analysis . . . . .	95
6.2	<i>hp</i> -Error bounds on the hypercube . . . . .	96
6.2.1	Isotropic polynomials degrees . . . . .	97
6.2.2	Anisotropic polynomial degrees . . . . .	98
6.3	<i>A priori</i> error analysis . . . . .	101
6.4	<i>hp</i> -Adaptivity on isotropically refined meshes . . . . .	106
6.4.1	<i>hp</i> -extension control . . . . .	109
6.5	Numerical Experiments . . . . .	111
6.5.1	Mixed hyperbolic-elliptic problem . . . . .	111
6.5.2	ADIGMA MTC1: Inviscid flow around a NACA0012 airfoil . . . . .	117
6.5.3	ADIGMA MTC3: Laminar flow around a NACA0012 airfoil . . . . .	120
6.6	Anisotropic <i>hp</i> -mesh adaptation . . . . .	121
6.7	Numerical experiments . . . . .	124

6.7.1	Singularly perturbed advection–diffusion problem . . . . .	124
6.7.2	Mixed hyperbolic–elliptic problem . . . . .	126
6.7.3	ADIGMA MTC3: Laminar flow around a NACA0012 airfoil . . . . .	129
<b>7</b>	<b>Application of error estimation and adaptation to complex flows</b>	<b>132</b>
7.1	ADIGMA BTC0: Laminar flow around streamlined body . . . . .	133
7.2	ADIGMA BTC3: Laminar flow around delta wing . . . . .	136
7.3	ADIGMA BTC1: L1T2 high-lift configuration . . . . .	139
7.4	ADIGMA BTC0: Turbulent flow around streamlined body . . . . .	148
7.5	ADIGMA CTC4 (modified): Subsonic turbulent flow around DLR-F6 wing- body configuration without fairing . . . . .	150
	<b>Acknowledgements</b>	<b>151</b>
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>156</b>